

1 MICHAEL J. JAURIGUE (SB# 208123)  
2 LIANA M. KHACHATOURIAN (SB# 337126)  
3 michael@jlglawyers.com  
4 liana@jlglawyers.com  
5 JAURIGUE LAW GROUP  
6 300 W. Glenoaks Blvd. Suite 300  
Glendale, California 91202  
Telephone: 818-630-7280  
Facsimile: 888-879-1697

7 Attorneys for Plaintiff  
8 MIGUEL MARIN

9 ELIZABETH A. BROWN (SB# 235429)  
JENNIFER SVANFELDT (SB# 233248)  
10 CHRISTINA C.K. SEMMER (SB# 270909)  
lisabrown@gbgllp.com  
11 jensvanfeldt@gbgllp.com  
christinasemmer@gbgllp.com  
12 GBG LLP  
633 West 5<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 1500  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
14 Telephone: (213) 358-2810  
Facsimile: (213) 995-6382

15 Attorneys for Defendant  
16 AT&T MOBILITY SERVICES LLC

17 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
18 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

20 MIGUEL MARIN,

21 Plaintiff,

22 vs.

24 AT&T MOBILITY SERVICES LLC and  
Does 1 through 50, inclusive,

26 Defendants.  
27

28 Case No. 2:23-cv-03747-MWF-MAA

**[PROPOSED] STIPULATED  
PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Judge: Hon. Michael W. Fitzgerald  
Dept.: 5A, First Street Courthouse

1     **1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

2         Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,  
3 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public  
4 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be  
5 warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter  
6 the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this  
7 Stipulated Protective Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or  
8 responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and  
9 use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential  
10 treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as  
11 set forth in Section 13.3 below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle  
12 them to file confidential information under seal; Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the  
13 procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party  
14 seeks permission from the Court to file material under seal.

15     **2. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT**

16         This action is likely to involve the exchange of records and information  
17 referencing or otherwise reflecting certain business practices, internal procedures,  
18 sensitive internal investigations, customer and employee information, and other  
19 valuable research, development, commercial, financial, technical and/or proprietary  
20 information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any  
21 purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such confidential and  
22 proprietary materials and information consist of, among other things, confidential business  
23 practices, or other confidential research, development, or commercial information  
24 (including information implicating privacy rights of third parties), information  
25 otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or  
26 otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case  
27 decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to

1 facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery  
2 materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep  
3 confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such  
4 material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the  
5 end of the litigation, and to serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such  
6 information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information  
7 will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so  
8 designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential,  
9 non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public  
10 record of this case.

11 **3. DEFINITIONS**

- 12     3.1. Action: *Miguel Marin v. AT&T Mobility Services LLC and Does 1*  
13         *through 50, inclusive* (C.D. Cal. Case No. 2:23-cv-03747-MWF-  
14         MAA).
- 15     3.2. Challenging Party: A Party or Nonparty that challenges the designation  
16         of information or items under this Stipulated Protective Order.
- 17     3.3. “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: Information (regardless of  
18         how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that  
19         qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and  
20         as specified above in the Good Cause Statement.
- 21     3.4. Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and In-House Counsel (as well as  
22         their support staff).
- 23     3.5. Designating Party: A Party or Nonparty that designates information or  
24         items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as  
25         “CONFIDENTIAL.”
- 26     3.6. Disclosure or Discovery Material: All items or information, regardless  
27         of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or  
28         maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and

1                   tangible things), that is produced or generated in disclosures or  
2                   responses to discovery in this matter.

- 3                   3.7. Expert: A person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter  
4                   pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its  
5                   counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.
- 6                   3.8. In-House Counsel: Attorneys who are employees of a party to this  
7                   Action. In-House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record  
8                   or any other outside counsel.
- 9                   3.9. Nonparty: Any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or  
10                  other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.
- 11                  3.10. Outside Counsel of Record: Attorneys who are not employees of a  
12                  party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to  
13                  this Action and have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or  
14                  are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that  
15                  party, and includes support staff.
- 16                  3.11. Party: Any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,  
17                  employees, consultants, retained experts, In-House Counsel, and  
18                  Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).
- 19                  3.12. Producing Party: A Party or Nonparty that produces Disclosure or  
20                  Discovery Material in this Action.
- 21                  3.13. Professional Vendors: Persons or entities that provide litigation  
22                  support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating,  
23                  preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or  
24                  retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and  
25                  subcontractors.
- 26                  3.14. Protected Material: Any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is  
27                  designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”
- 28                  3.15. Receiving Party: A Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery

1 Material from a Producing Party.

2 **4. SCOPE**

3 The protections conferred by this Stipulated Protective Order cover not only  
4 Protected Material, but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected  
5 Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material;  
6 and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that  
7 might reveal Protected Material.

8 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the  
9 trial judge. This Stipulated Protective Order does not govern the use of Protected  
10 Material at trial.

11 **5. DURATION**

12 Once a case proceeds to trial, all of the information that was designated as  
13 confidential or maintained pursuant to this Stipulated Protective Order becomes  
14 public and presumptively will be available to all members of the public, including  
15 the press, unless compelling reasons supported by specific factual findings to proceed  
16 otherwise are made to the trial judge in advance of the trial. *See Kamakana v. City*  
17 *and County of Honolulu*, 447 F.3d 1172, 1180-81 (9th Cir. 2006) (distinguishing  
18 “good cause” showing for sealing documents produced in discovery from  
19 “compelling reasons” standard when merits-related documents are part of court  
20 record). Accordingly, the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order do not extend  
21 beyond the commencement of the trial.

22 **6. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

23 **6.1. Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.**

24 Each Party or Nonparty that designates information or items for  
25 protection under this Stipulated Protective Order must take care to limit  
26 any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the  
27 appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for  
28

protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

#### 6.2. Manner and Timing of Designations.

Except as otherwise provided in this Stipulated Protective Order (*see, e.g.*, Section 6.2(a)), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Stipulated Protective Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

Designation in conformity with this Stipulated Protective Order requires the following:

- (a) For information in documentary form (*e.g.*, paper or electronic documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (*e.g.*, by making appropriate markings in the margins).

A Party or Nonparty that makes original documents available for inspection need not designate them for protection

1 until after the inspecting Party has indicated which documents it  
2 would like copied and produced. During the inspection and  
3 before the designation, all of the material made available for  
4 inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the  
5 inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and  
6 produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents,  
7 or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Stipulated  
8 Protective Order. Then, before producing the specified  
9 documents, the Producing Party must affix the legend  
10 "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains Protected  
11 Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page  
12 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly  
13 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate  
14 markings in the margins).

- (b) For testimony given in depositions, that the Designating Party identify the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition, all protected testimony.
  - (c) For information produced in nondocumentary form, and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

### **6.3. Inadvertent Failure to Designate.**

If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Stipulated Protective Order.

1                   for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the  
 2 Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material  
 3 is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Stipulated Protective  
 4 Order.

5                   **7. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

6                   **7.1. Timing of Challenges.**

7                   Any Party or Nonparty may challenge a designation of confidentiality  
 8 at any time that is consistent with the Court's Scheduling Order.

9                   **7.2. Meet and Confer.**

10                  The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process,  
 11 which shall comply with Local Rule 37.1 et seq., and with Section 4 of Judge  
 12 Audero's Procedures ("Mandatory Telephonic Conference for Discovery  
 13 Disputes").<sup>1</sup>

14                  **7.3. Burden of Persuasion.**

15                  The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on  
 16 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper  
 17 purpose (*e.g.*, to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other  
 18 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the  
 19 Designating Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all  
 20 parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection  
 21 to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court  
 22 rules on the challenge.

23                  **8. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIALS**

24                  **8.1. Basic Principles.**

25                  A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or  
 26 produced by another Party or by a Nonparty in connection with this Action

---

27                  <sup>1</sup> Judge Audero's Procedures are available at  
 28 <https://www.cacd.uscourts.gov/honorable-maria-audero>.

only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Stipulated Protective Order. When the Action reaches a final disposition, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of Section 14 below.

Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order.

#### 8.2. Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items.

Unless otherwise ordered by the Court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

- (a) The Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this Action;
- (b) The officers, directors, and employees (including In-House Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;
- (c) Experts of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);
- (d) The Court and its personnel;
- (e) Court reporters and their staff;
- (f) Professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to be Bound” (Exhibit A);
- (g) The author or recipient of a document containing the

1 information or a custodian or other person who otherwise  
2 possessed or knew the information;

- 3 (h) During their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses,  
4 in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary  
5 provided: (i) the deposing party requests that the witness sign  
6 the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit  
7 A); and (ii) the witness will not be permitted to keep any  
8 confidential information unless they sign the "Acknowledgment  
9 and Agreement to Be Bound," unless otherwise agreed by the  
10 Designating Party or ordered by the Court. Pages of transcribed  
11 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal  
12 Protected Material may be separately bound by the court  
13 reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted  
14 under this Stipulated Protective Order; and  
15 (i) Any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting  
16 personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged  
17 in settlement discussions.

18 **9. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED**  
19 **PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION**

20 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation  
21 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as  
22 "CONFIDENTIAL," that Party must:

- 23 (a) Promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification  
24 shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;  
25 (b) Promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order  
26 to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered  
27 by the subpoena or order is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order.  
28 Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective

## Order; and

- (c) Cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the Court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

**10. A NONPARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE  
PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION**

### 10.1. Application.

The terms of this Stipulated Protective Order are applicable to information produced by a Nonparty in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Nonparties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Stipulated Protective Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Nonparty from seeking additional protections.

## 10.2. Notification.

In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Nonparty's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Nonparty not to produce the Nonparty's confidential information, then the Party shall:

- (a) Promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Nonparty that some or all of the information requested is subject

1 to a confidentiality agreement with a Nonparty;

- 2 (b) Promptly provide the Nonparty with a copy of the Stipulated  
3 Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery  
4 request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the  
5 information requested; and  
6 (c) Make the information requested available for inspection by the  
7 Nonparty, if requested.

8 10.3. Conditions of Production.

9 If the Nonparty fails to seek a protective order from this Court within  
10 fourteen (14) days after receiving the notice and accompanying information,  
11 the Receiving Party may produce the Nonparty's confidential information  
12 responsive to the discovery request. If the Nonparty timely seeks a protective  
13 order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession  
14 or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Nonparty  
15 before a determination by the Court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the  
16 Nonparty shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this Court  
17 of its Protected Material.

18 **11. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

19 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed  
20 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this  
21 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party immediately must (1) notify in  
22 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (2) use its best efforts  
23 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (3) inform the person or  
24 persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this  
25 Stipulated Protective Order, and (4) request such person or persons to execute the  
26 "Acknowledgment and Agreement to be Bound" (Exhibit A).

1       **12. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE**  
2       **PROTECTED MATERIAL**

3       When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain  
4       inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,  
5       the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil  
6       Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure  
7       may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior  
8       privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the  
9       parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or  
10      information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the  
11      parties may incorporate their agreement in the Stipulated Protective Order submitted  
12      to the Court.

13       **13. MISCELLANEOUS**

14       13.1. Right to Further Relief.

15       Nothing in this Stipulated Protective Order abridges the right of any  
16      person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

17       13.2. Right to Assert Other Objections.

18       By stipulating to the entry of this Stipulated Protective Order, no Party  
19      waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing  
20      any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated  
21      Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground  
22      to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Stipulated Protective  
23      Order.

24       13.3. Filing Protected Material.

25       A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply  
26      with Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant  
27      to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at  
28      issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the

1                   Court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record  
2                   unless otherwise instructed by the Court.

3                  **14. FINAL DISPOSITION**

4                  After the final disposition of this Action, within sixty (60) days of a written  
5                  request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return all Protected  
6                  Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision,  
7                  “all Protected Material” includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and  
8                  any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether  
9                  the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a  
10                 written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to  
11                 the Designating Party) by the 60-day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where  
12                 appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms  
13                 that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations,  
14                 summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected  
15                 Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel is entitled to retain an archival  
16                 copy of all pleadings; motion papers; trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts; legal  
17                 memoranda; correspondence; deposition and trial exhibits; expert reports; attorney  
18                 work product; and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain  
19                 Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected  
20                 Material remain subject to this Stipulated Protective Order as set forth in Section 5.

21                 ///

22                 ///

23                 ///

24                 ///

25                 ///

26                 ///

27                 ///

28

## **15. VIOLATION**

Any violation of this Stipulated Order may be punished by any and all appropriate measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.

**IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.**

DATED: August 18, 2023

JAURIGUE LAW GROUP

By: Liana Khachatourian  
Michael J. Jaurigue  
Liana M. Khachatourian

Attorneys for Plaintiff  
**MIGUEL MARIN**

DATED: August 18, 2023

GBG LLP

By: /s/ Christina C.K. Semmer  
CHRISTINA C.K. SEMMER

Attnorneys for Defendant  
AT&T MOBILITY SERVICES LLC

**FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

DATED: August 24, 2023

Patricia Donahue

Patricia Donahue ~~Maria-A-A-ero~~

## United States Magistrate Judge

1 EXHIBIT A  
2

3 **ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND**  
4

5 I, \_\_\_\_\_ [full name], of \_\_\_\_\_ [address], declare under penalty of perjury that  
6 I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was  
7 issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California on  
8 \_\_\_\_\_ [date] in the case of *Miguel Marin v. AT&T Mobility Services LLC et al.*, C.D. Cal. Case No. 2:23-cv-03747-MWF-MAA. I agree to  
9 comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order,  
10 and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to  
11 sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will  
12 not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated  
13 Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the  
14 provisions of this Stipulated Protective Order.

15 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court  
16 for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this  
17 Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after  
18 termination of this action. I hereby appoint \_\_\_\_\_ [full name]  
19 of \_\_\_\_\_ [address and telephone number]  
20 as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any  
21 proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

22 Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

23 Printed Name: \_\_\_\_\_

24 Date: \_\_\_\_\_

25 City and State Where Sworn and Signed: \_\_\_\_\_